University of Stirling logo

Research Degree

Examiners Report for PhD Resubmission

Examiners are required to:

* Read the [Code of Practice point 81-96](https://www.stir.ac.uk/about/professional-services/student-academic-and-corporate-services/academic-registry/policy-and-procedure/code-of-practice-research-degrees/) and [point 61- 74 of the Postgraduate Research Regulations](https://www.stir.ac.uk/about/professional-services/student-academic-and-corporate-services/academic-registry/regulations/postgraduate-research-regulations/#ass).
* Consult the [Examiners checklist](#Checklist) at the bottom of the form.
* independently complete, sign and date a pre-viva examination written report on the thesis prior to viva, and upon completion notify the Independent Chair.
* complete all remaining sections of the report following the viva, signing and dating the final recommendation.
* notify Student Administration, via the Independent Chair, that the completed Examiner Report is ready. Email [PGRStudentAdmin@stir.ac.uk](mailto:PGRStudentAdmin@stir.ac.uk) within two weeks of the viva

# **Exam Details**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Faculty/Division:** | **Choose an item.** |
| **Candidate’s Full**  **Name:** |  |
| **Student ID:** |  |
| **Title of Thesis:** |  |
| **Thesis Word Count:** |  |
| **Independent Chair:** |  |
| **Name and Institution of External Examiner(s):** |  |
| **Internal Examiner(s):** |  |

# **Pre-Viva Examination Report**

* 1. Internal Examiner 1 written report

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Examiner Name:** |  |

|  |
| --- |
| This section of the report is the independent statement of one Examiner.  The Examiner is required to:   * read the [Code of Practice point 81-96](https://www.stir.ac.uk/about/professional-services/student-academic-and-corporate-services/academic-registry/policy-and-procedure/code-of-practice-research-degrees/) and [point 61- 74 of the Postgraduate Research Regulations](https://www.stir.ac.uk/about/professional-services/student-academic-and-corporate-services/academic-registry/regulations/postgraduate-research-regulations/#ass) prior to completion of this report. * complete, sign and date this report, and notify the Independent Chair, at least two days prior to the viva examination and before conferral with the other Examiners. * indicate clearly the strengths and weaknesses of the thesis in relation to the criteria for the degree of PhD and identify issues to be discussed during the viva examination. * comment on whether, in the opinion of the Examiner, any part(s) of the work are publishable. |

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Signature of Examiner:** | **Date:** |

* 1. Internal Examiner 2 written report

*(if applicable)*

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Examiner Name:** |  |

|  |
| --- |
| This section of the report is the independent statement of one Examiner.  The Examiner is required to:   * read the [Code of Practice point 81-96](https://www.stir.ac.uk/about/professional-services/student-academic-and-corporate-services/academic-registry/policy-and-procedure/code-of-practice-research-degrees/) and [point 61- 74 of the Postgraduate Research Regulations](https://www.stir.ac.uk/about/professional-services/student-academic-and-corporate-services/academic-registry/regulations/postgraduate-research-regulations/#ass) prior to completion of this report. * complete, sign and date this report, and notify the Independent Chair, at least two days prior to the viva examination and before conferral with the other Examiners. * indicate clearly the strengths and weaknesses of the thesis in relation to the criteria for the degree of PhD and identify issues to be discussed during the viva examination. * comment on whether, in the opinion of the Examiner, any part(s) of the work are publishable. |

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Signature of Examiner:** | **Date:** |

2.3 External Examiner 1 written report

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Examiner Name:** |  |

|  |
| --- |
| This section of the report is the independent statement of one Examiner.  The Examiner is required to:   * read the [Code of Practice point 81-96](https://www.stir.ac.uk/about/professional-services/student-academic-and-corporate-services/academic-registry/policy-and-procedure/code-of-practice-research-degrees/) and [point 61- 74 of the Postgraduate Research Regulations](https://www.stir.ac.uk/about/professional-services/student-academic-and-corporate-services/academic-registry/regulations/postgraduate-research-regulations/#ass) prior to completion of this report. * complete, sign and date this report, and notify the Independent Chair, at least two days prior to the viva examination and before conferral with the other Examiners. * indicate clearly the strengths and weaknesses of the thesis in relation to the criteria for the degree of PhD and identify issues to be discussed during the viva examination. * comment on whether, in the opinion of the Examiner, any part(s) of the work are publishable. |

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Signature of Examiner:** | **Date:** |

* 1. External Examiner 2 written report

*(if applicable)*

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Examiner Name:** |  |

|  |
| --- |
| This section of the report is the independent statement of one Examiner.  The Examiner is required to:   * read the [Code of Practice point 81-96](https://www.stir.ac.uk/about/professional-services/student-academic-and-corporate-services/academic-registry/policy-and-procedure/code-of-practice-research-degrees/) and [point 61- 74 of the Postgraduate Research Regulations](https://www.stir.ac.uk/about/professional-services/student-academic-and-corporate-services/academic-registry/regulations/postgraduate-research-regulations/#ass) prior to completion of this report. * complete, sign and date this report, and notify the Independent Chair, at least two days prior to the viva examination and before conferral with the other Examiners. * indicate clearly the strengths and weaknesses of the thesis in relation to the criteria for the degree of PhD and identify issues to be discussed during the viva examination. * comment on whether, in the opinion of the Examiner, any part(s) of the work are publishable. |

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Signature of Examiner:** | **Date:** |

# **Key Questions**

|  |
| --- |
| To award the degree, the Examining Committee is required to answer YES to all of the below questions. Where NO is selected, the recommendation of the committee should be corrections, amendments, resubmission, a lower award or no award. Details of why NO was selected must be outlined in the comments section. |

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| 1 Does the thesis indicate adequate knowledge of the field of study and associated literature? | Choose an item. |

Comments:

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| 2 Does the thesis indicate the ability to assess critical ideas and relate the investigations to a wider field of knowledge? | Choose an item. |

Comments:

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| 3 Is the thesis derived from a coherent study, reasonably achievable within the accepted timeframe? (See [Postgraduate Research Regulation 23](https://www.stir.ac.uk/about/professional-services/student-academic-and-corporate-services/academic-registry/regulations/postgraduate-research-regulations/)) | Choose an item. |

Comments:

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| 4 Is the thesis properly presented, both in literary terms and overall structural terms? | Choose an item. |

Comments:

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| 5 Is the thesis properly and adequately referenced? | Choose an item. |

Comments:

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| 6 In the viva examination, did the candidate demonstrate an adequate defence of the thesis? | Choose an item. |

Comments:

|  |
| --- |
| Second Viva  In exceptional circumstances, the second viva may be waived following resubmission, at the request of the Examining Committee.  Such a request can only be made once all Examiners have examined the revised thesis.  All members of the Examining Committee must be in agreement and a case explaining the rationale behind the request must be made in Section 4 of the Examining Committee report.  Request to waive second viva? - Choose an item. |

# **Joint Examiners’ Written Report (Post-Viva Examination)**

|  |
| --- |
| 4a. The report is the joint statement agreed by all Examiners.  Examiners are required to:   * read the [Code of Practice point 81-96](https://www.stir.ac.uk/about/professional-services/student-academic-and-corporate-services/academic-registry/policy-and-procedure/code-of-practice-research-degrees/) and [point 61- 74 of the Postgraduate Research Regulations](https://www.stir.ac.uk/about/professional-services/student-academic-and-corporate-services/academic-registry/regulations/postgraduate-research-regulations/#ass) prior to completion of this report. * comment on the defence of the thesis and overall performance in the viva examination.   NB: If Examiners were not in agreement about a recommendation prior to viva, Section 4b should also be completed. |
| 4b. Statement on Reaching Consensus (where Examiners were not in agreement prior to viva): |

# **Recommendations of Examiners**

For guidance regarding recommendations, please refer to the [Code of Practice](https://www.stir.ac.uk/about/professional-services/student-academic-and-corporate-services/academic-registry/policy-and-procedure/code-of-practice-research-degrees/).

Please note that the Examining Committee recommendations are subject to approval by the University.

|  |
| --- |
| ☐ Award - the degree of Doctor of Philosophy to be granted.  This recommendation should be made if the candidate has met all the requirements for the degree and the thesis is free of typographical errors. |

|  |
| --- |
| ☐ Corrections - the degree of Doctor of Philosophy to be granted subject to minor corrections.  A recommendation that the degree be awarded subject to specific corrections being formally confirmed by a nominated Examiner within one month.  The thesis requires correction of presentational and or/typographical errors before it is fit for the public domain. Examiners should attach a list of corrections to the Examiner Report.   * Specify nominated Examiner: * Correction submission period (maximum 1 month): Choose an item. |

|  |
| --- |
| ☐ Amendments - the degree of Doctor of Philosophy to be granted subject to specific amendments.  A recommendation that the degree be awarded subject to specific amendments being formally confirmed by a nominated Examiner within a maximum of six months. Work in the thesis requires re-presenting or existing text needs restructuring. Examiners should attach a list of amendments to the Examiner Report.   * Specify nominated Examiner: * Amendments submission period (minimum 2 months - maximum 6 months): Choose an item. |

|  |
| --- |
| ☐ Award of MPhil – the degree of Master of Philosophy to be granted.  The thesis is substantially deficient in one or more requirements for the award of Doctor of Philosophy and cannot be revised to satisfy these requirements, but the thesis satisfies the requirements of Master of Philosophy. |

|  |
| --- |
| ☐ Corrections for MPhil- the degree of Master of Philosophy to be granted subject to minor corrections.  A recommendation that the lower degree of MPhil be awarded subject to specific corrections being formally confirmed by a nominated Examiner within one month.  The thesis requires correction of presentational and or/typographical errors before it is fit for the public domain. Examiners should attach a list of corrections to the Examiner Report.   * Specify nominated Examiner: * Correction submission period (maximum 1 month): Choose an item. |

|  |
| --- |
| ☐ Amendments for MPhil - the degree of Master of Philosophy to be granted subject to specific amendments.  A recommendation that the lower degree of MPhil be awarded subject to specific amendments being formally confirmed by a nominated Examiner within a maximum of six months.  Work in the thesis requires re-presenting or existing text needs restructuring. Examiners should attach a list of amendments to the Examiner Report.   * Specify nominated Examiner: * Amendments submission period (minimum 2 months - maximum 6 months): Choose an item. |

|  |
| --- |
| ☐ No award.  The thesis is substantially deficient in all or any of the requirements for the degree and cannot be revised to satisfy these requirements, or the requirements of any other research degree. |

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Date and location of viva examination:** |  |

Signature of Examiners:

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| 1 | **(Independent Chair)** | **Date:** |
| 2 |  |  |
| 3 |  |  |
| 4 |  |  |

**Research Examiners Checklist**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **SECTION** | **ACTION** | **√** |
| 1. Details | NO ACTION REQUIRED |  |
| 1. Pre-viva | * the pre-viva report section is completed independently by each Examiner following the reading of the thesis and prior to the viva (i.e. one pre-viva report per Examiner) * each Examiner must sign and date their pre-viva report * pre-viva reports must be attached to main report |  |
| 1. Key Questions | * answer all questions ‘yes’ or ‘no’ * add comment if answering ‘no’ * add comment where appropriate if answering ‘yes’ |  |
| 1. Post-viva | * Examiners are to agree a joint statement following the viva |  |
| 1. Recommendations | * tick appropriate recommendation * if ‘Corrections’ are recommended, specify the Examiner to approve changes (only one Examiner may be nominated), the period (max one month) and the nature of the changes * if ‘Amendments’ are recommended, specify the Examiner to approve changes (only one Examiner may be nominated), the period (max six month) and the nature of the changes * provide details of the date and location of viva * all Examiners must sign and date this page |  |

Examiners should complete the report electronically. The Independent Chair should notify [PGRStudentAdmin@stir.ac.uk](mailto:PGRStudentAdmin@stir.ac.uk) when the completed report is ready. This must be within 2 weeks of the viva taking place.