

International Journal of Sports Science & Coaching

A Comparison of US and Scotland Youth Soccer Coaches' Legal Consciousness Regarding Concussion Safety Regulations

Journal:	<i>International Journal of Sports Science & Coaching</i>
Manuscript ID	SPO-20-0364
Manuscript Type:	Original Article
Date Submitted by the Author:	19-Jun-2020
Complete List of Authors:	DeMartini, Anne; Flagler College, Kim, Sungwon; St. John's University , Sport Management Connaughton, Daniel; University of Florida , Tourism, Recreation & Sport Management McArdle, David; University of Stirling
Keywords:	concussion, legal consciousness, girls' soccer, head injury, association football, risk management, law
Abstract:	<p>Due to the severe health consequences of sport related concussion (SRC), governments and sport governing bodies around the world have enacted numerous measures including changes to legislation and rules of the game, and increased emphasis on coach education. This study compared the legal consciousness of girls' youth soccer coaches regarding concussion management under a statutory legal regime in the U.S. and a non-statutory regime in Scotland. The present study collected qualitative data through ten interviews of girls' youth soccer coaches in Scotland and another ten interviews of girls' high school soccer coaches in the U.S. Utilizing the socio-legal theory of legal consciousness, the findings support the idea that people make connections from their past experiences to shape their understanding of the law. We observed variance between U.S. and Scottish coaches' legal consciousness. Overall, all coaches exhibited a version of conformity to and engagement with SRC management guidance and little resistance. Florida coaches displayed more conformity, likely due to the SRC educated mandated by law. Scottish coaches who had coached in the U.S. previously demonstrated the strongest resistance. The findings suggest a need for continued improvement in the implementation of SRC laws and guidelines including updated training and better dissemination of educational materials.</p>

SCHOLARONE™
Manuscripts

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

A Comparison of US and Scotland Youth Soccer Coaches' Legal Consciousness Regarding Concussion Safety Regulations

Anne L. DeMartini, J.D., M.Ed

Associate Professor

Sport Management Program

Flagler College

74 King St

St Augustine, FL 32080

ademartini@flagler.edu

904 599 5220

<https://orcid.org/0000-0001-5921-0641>

Sungwon Kim, Ph.D.

Assistant Professor

Division of Sport Management

The Collins College of Professional Studies

St. John's University

8000 Utopia Pkwy

Jamaica, NY 11439

kims1@stjohns.edu

<https://orcid.org/0000-0003-2136-7613>

Daniel P. Connaughton, EdD

Professor, Department of Sport Management

College of Health & Human Performance

University of Florida

1864 Stadium Rd, Gainesville, FL 32603

danc@hhp.ufl.edu

<https://orcid.org/0000-0001-7421-3138>

Dr David McArdle

Head of Law and Law REF Co-ordinator

Stirling University

Stirling FK9 4LA, United Kingdom

d.a.mcardle@stir.ac.uk

0786 397 2284

<https://orcid.org/0000-0002-4813-6420>

1
2
3
47 **Title:** A Comparison of US and Scotland Youth Soccer Coaches' Legal Consciousness Regarding Concussion
48 Safety Regulations
49
50
51

52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60
61
62
63
64
65
66
67
68
69
70
71
72
73
74
75
76
77
78
79
80
81
82
83
84
85
86
87
88
89
90
91
92
93
94
95
96
97
98
99
100
Short title: International comparison of legal consciousness of girls' soccer coaches

101
102
103
104
105
106
107
108
109
110
111
112
113
114
115
116
117
118
119
120
121
122
123
124
125
126
127
128
129
130
131
132
133
134
135
136
137
138
139
140
141
142
143
144
145
146
147
148
149
150
151
152
153
154
155
156
157
158
159
160
161
162
163
164
165
166
167
168
169
170
171
172
173
174
175
176
177
178
179
180
181
182
183
184
185
186
187
188
189
190
191
192
193
194
195
196
197
198
199
200
Abstract:

201
202
203
204
205
206
207
208
209
210
211
212
213
214
215
216
217
218
219
220
221
222
223
224
225
226
227
228
229
230
231
232
233
234
235
236
237
238
239
240
241
242
243
244
245
246
247
248
249
250
251
252
253
254
255
256
257
258
259
260
261
262
263
264
265
266
267
268
269
270
271
272
273
274
275
276
277
278
279
280
281
282
283
284
285
286
287
288
289
290
291
292
293
294
295
296
297
298
299
300
301
302
303
304
305
306
307
308
309
310
311
312
313
314
315
316
317
318
319
320
321
322
323
324
325
326
327
328
329
330
331
332
333
334
335
336
337
338
339
340
341
342
343
344
345
346
347
348
349
350
351
352
353
354
355
356
357
358
359
360
361
362
363
364
365
366
367
368
369
370
371
372
373
374
375
376
377
378
379
380
381
382
383
384
385
386
387
388
389
390
391
392
393
394
395
396
397
398
399
400
401
402
403
404
405
406
407
408
409
410
411
412
413
414
415
416
417
418
419
420
421
422
423
424
425
426
427
428
429
430
431
432
433
434
435
436
437
438
439
440
441
442
443
444
445
446
447
448
449
450
451
452
453
454
455
456
457
458
459
460
461
462
463
464
465
466
467
468
469
470
471
472
473
474
475
476
477
478
479
480
481
482
483
484
485
486
487
488
489
490
491
492
493
494
495
496
497
498
499
500
501
502
503
504
505
506
507
508
509
510
511
512
513
514
515
516
517
518
519
520
521
522
523
524
525
526
527
528
529
530
531
532
533
534
535
536
537
538
539
540
541
542
543
544
545
546
547
548
549
550
551
552
553
554
555
556
557
558
559
560
561
562
563
564
565
566
567
568
569
570
571
572
573
574
575
576
577
578
579
580
581
582
583
584
585
586
587
588
589
590
591
592
593
594
595
596
597
598
599
600
601
602
603
604
605
606
607
608
609
610
611
612
613
614
615
616
617
618
619
620
621
622
623
624
625
626
627
628
629
630
631
632
633
634
635
636
637
638
639
640
641
642
643
644
645
646
647
648
649
650
651
652
653
654
655
656
657
658
659
660
661
662
663
664
665
666
667
668
669
670
671
672
673
674
675
676
677
678
679
680
681
682
683
684
685
686
687
688
689
690
691
692
693
694
695
696
697
698
699
700
701
702
703
704
705
706
707
708
709
710
711
712
713
714
715
716
717
718
719
720
721
722
723
724
725
726
727
728
729
730
731
732
733
734
735
736
737
738
739
740
741
742
743
744
745
746
747
748
749
750
751
752
753
754
755
756
757
758
759
760
761
762
763
764
765
766
767
768
769
770
771
772
773
774
775
776
777
778
779
780
781
782
783
784
785
786
787
788
789
790
791
792
793
794
795
796
797
798
799
800
801
802
803
804
805
806
807
808
809
810
811
812
813
814
815
816
817
818
819
820
821
822
823
824
825
826
827
828
829
830
831
832
833
834
835
836
837
838
839
840
841
842
843
844
845
846
847
848
849
850
851
852
853
854
855
856
857
858
859
860
861
862
863
864
865
866
867
868
869
870
871
872
873
874
875
876
877
878
879
880
881
882
883
884
885
886
887
888
889
890
891
892
893
894
895
896
897
898
899
900
901
902
903
904
905
906
907
908
909
910
911
912
913
914
915
916
917
918
919
920
921
922
923
924
925
926
927
928
929
930
931
932
933
934
935
936
937
938
939
940
941
942
943
944
945
946
947
948
949
950
951
952
953
954
955
956
957
958
959
960
961
962
963
964
965
966
967
968
969
970
971
972
973
974
975
976
977
978
979
980
981
982
983
984
985
986
987
988
989
990
991
992
993
994
995
996
997
998
999
1000

1001
1002
1003
1004
1005
1006
1007
1008
1009
1010
1011
1012
1013
1014
1015
1016
1017
1018
1019
1020
1021
1022
1023
1024
1025
1026
1027
1028
1029
1030
1031
1032
1033
1034
1035
1036
1037
1038
1039
1040
1041
1042
1043
1044
1045
1046
1047
1048
1049
1050
1051
1052
1053
1054
1055
1056
1057
1058
1059
1060
1061
1062
1063
1064
1065
1066
1067
1068
1069
1070
1071
1072
1073
1074
1075
1076
1077
1078
1079
1080
1081
1082
1083
1084
1085
1086
1087
1088
1089
1090
1091
1092
1093
1094
1095
1096
1097
1098
1099
1100
1101
1102
1103
1104
1105
1106
1107
1108
1109
1110
1111
1112
1113
1114
1115
1116
1117
1118
1119
1120
1121
1122
1123
1124
1125
1126
1127
1128
1129
1130
1131
1132
1133
1134
1135
1136
1137
1138
1139
1140
1141
1142
1143
1144
1145
1146
1147
1148
1149
1150
1151
1152
1153
1154
1155
1156
1157
1158
1159
1160
1161
1162
1163
1164
1165
1166
1167
1168
1169
1170
1171
1172
1173
1174
1175
1176
1177
1178
1179
1180
1181
1182
1183
1184
1185
1186
1187
1188
1189
1190
1191
1192
1193
1194
1195
1196
1197
1198
1199
1200
1201
1202
1203
1204
1205
1206
1207
1208
1209
1210
1211
1212
1213
1214
1215
1216
1217
1218
1219
1220
1221
1222
1223
1224
1225
1226
1227
1228
1229
1230
1231
1232
1233
1234
1235
1236
1237
1238
1239
1240
1241
1242
1243
1244
1245
1246
1247
1248
1249
1250
1251
1252
1253
1254
1255
1256
1257
1258
1259
1260
1261
1262
1263
1264
1265
1266
1267
1268
1269
1270
1271
1272
1273
1274
1275
1276
1277
1278
1279
1280
1281
1282
1283
1284
1285
1286
1287
1288
1289
1290
1291
1292
1293
1294
1295
1296
1297
1298
1299
1300
1301
1302
1303
1304
1305
1306
1307
1308
1309
1310
1311
1312
1313
1314
1315
1316
1317
1318
1319
1320
1321
1322
1323
1324
1325
1326
1327
1328
1329
1330
1331
1332
1333
1334
1335
1336
1337
1338
1339
1340
1341
1342
1343
1344
1345
1346
1347
1348
1349
1350
1351
1352
1353
1354
1355
1356
1357
1358
1359
1360
1361
1362
1363
1364
1365
1366
1367
1368
1369
1370
1371
1372
1373
1374
1375
1376
1377
1378
1379
1380
1381
1382
1383
1384
1385
1386
1387
1388
1389
1390
1391
1392
1393
1394
1395
1396
1397
1398
1399
1400
1401
1402
1403
1404
1405
1406
1407
1408
1409
1410
1411
1412
1413
1414
1415
1416
1417
1418
1419
1420
1421
1422
1423
1424
1425
1426
1427
1428
1429
1430
1431
1432
1433
1434
1435
1436
1437
1438
1439
1440
1441
1442
1443
1444
1445
1446
1447
1448
1449
1450
1451
1452
1453
1454
1455
1456
1457
1458
1459
1460
1461
1462
1463
1464
1465
1466
1467
1468
1469
1470
1471
1472
1473
1474
1475
1476
1477
1478
1479
1480
1481
1482
1483
1484
1485
1486
1487
1488
1489
1490
1491
1492
1493
1494
1495
1496
1497
1498
1499
1500
1501
1502
1503
1504
1505
1506
1507
1508
1509
1510
1511
1512
1513
1514
1515
1516
1517
1518
1519
1520
1521
1522
1523
1524
1525
1526
1527
1528
1529
1530
1531
1532
1533
1534
1535
1536
1537
1538
1539
1540
1541
1542
1543
1544
1545
1546
1547
1548
1549
1550
1551
1552
1553
1554
1555
1556
1557
1558
1559
1560
1561
1562
1563
1564
1565
1566
1567
1568
1569
1570
1571
1572
1573
1574
1575
1576
1577
1578
1579
1580
1581
1582
1583
1584
1585
1586
1587
1588
1589
1590
1591
1592
1593
1594
1595
1596
1597
1598
1599
1600
1601
1602
1603
1604
1605
1606
1607
1608
1609
1610
1611
1612
1613
1614
1615
1616
1617
1618
1619
1620
1621
1622
1623
1624
1625
1626
1627
1628
1629
1630
1631
1632
1633
1634
1635
1636
1637
1638
1639
1640
1641
1642
1643
1644
1645
1646
1647
1648
1649
1650
1651
1652
1653
1654
1655
1656
1657
1658
1659
1660
1661
1662
1663
1664
1665
1666
1667
1668
1669
1670
1671
1672
1673
1674
1675
1676
1677
1678
1679
1680
1681
1682
1683
1684
1685
1686
1687
1688
1689
1690
1691
1692
1693
1694
1695
1696
1697
1698
1699
1700
1701
1702
1703
1704
1705
1706
1707
1708
1709
1710
1711
1712
1713
1714
1715
1716
1717
1718
1719
1720
1721
1722
1723
1724
1725
1726
1727
1728
1729
1730
1731
1732
1733
1734
1735
1736
1737
1738
1739
1740
1741
1742
1743
1744
1745
1746
1747
1748
1749
1750
1751
1752
1753
1754
1755
1756
1757
1758
1759
1760
1761
1762
1763
1764
1765
1766
1767
1768
1769
1770
1771
1772
1773
1774
1775
1776
1777
1778
1779
1780
1781
1782
1783
1784
1785
1786
1787
1788
1789
1790
1791
1792
1793
1794
1795
1796
1797
1798
1799
1800
1801
1802
1803
1804
1805
1806
1807
1808
1809
1810
1811
1812
1813
1814
1815
1816
1817
1818
1819
1820
1821
1822
1823
1824
1825
1826
1827
1828
1829
1830
1831
1832
1833
1834
1835
1836
1837
1838
1839
1840
1841
1842
1843
1844
1845
1846
1847
1848
1849
1850
1851
1852
1853
1854
1855
1856
1857
1858
1859
1860
1861
1862
1863
1864
1865
1866
1867
1868
1869
1870
1871
1872
1873
1874
1875
1876
1877
1878
1879
1880
1881
1882
1883
1884
1885
1886
1887
1888
1889
1890
1891
1892
1893
1894
1895
1896
1897
1898
1899
1900
1901
1902
1903
1904
1905
1906
1907
1908
1909
1910
1911
1912
1913
1914
1915
1916
1917
1918
1919
1920
1921
1922
1923
1924
1925
1926
1927
1928
1929
1930
1931
1932
1933
1934
1935
1936
1937
1938
1939
1940
1941
1942
1943
1944
1945
1946
1947
1948
1949
1950
1951
1952
1953
1954
1955
1956
1957
1958
1959
1960
1961
1962
1963
1964
1965
1966
1967
1968
1969
1970
1971
1972
1973
1974
1975
1976
1977
1978
1979
1980
1981
1982
1983
1984
1985
1986
1987
1988
1989
1990
1991
1992
1993
1994
1995
1996
1997
1998
1999
2000
2001
2002
2003
2004
2005
2006
2007
2008
2009
2010
2011
2012
2013
2014
2015
2016
2017
2018
2019
2020
2021
2022
2023
2024
2025
2026
2027
2028
2029
2030
2031
2032
2033
2034
2035
2036
2037
2038
2039
2040
2041
2042
2043
2044
2045
2046
2047
2048
2049
2050
2051
2052
2053
2054
2055
2056
2057
2058
2059
2060
2061
2062
2063
2064
2065
2066
2067
2068
2069
2070
2071
2072
2073
2074
2075
2076
2077
2078
2079
2080
2081
2082
2083
2084
2085
2086
2087
2088
2089
2090
2091
2092
2093
2094
2095
2096
2097
2098
2099
2100
2101
2102
2103
2104
2105
2106
2107
2108
2109
2110
2111
2112
2113
2114
2115
2116
2117
2118
2119
2120
2121
2122
2123
2124
2125
2126
2127
2128
2129
2130
2131
2132
2133
2134
2135
2136
2137
2138
2139
2140
2141
2142
2143
2144
2145
2146
2147
2148
2149
2150
2151
2152
2153
2154
2155
2156
2157
2158
2159
2160
2161
2162
2163
2164
2165
2166
2167
2168
2169
2170
2171
2172
2173
2174
2175
2176
2177
2178
2179
2180
2181
2182
2183
2184
2185
2186
2187
2188
2189
2190
2191
2192
2193
2194
2195
2196
2197
2198
2199
2200
2201
2202
2203
2204
2205
2206
2207
2208
2209
2210
2211
2212
2213
2214
2215
2216
2217
2218
2219
2220
2221
2222
2223
2224
2225
222

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

For Peer Review

A Comparison of US and Scotland Youth Soccer Coaches' Legal Consciousness Regarding Concussion Safety Regulations

Introduction

The 5th International Conference on Concussion in Sport defined sport-related concussion (SRC) as “a traumatic brain injury induced by biochemical forces” that “typically results in the rapid onset of short-lived impairment of neurological function that resolves spontaneously.”(1, 2) Potential long-term effects of SRC on developing brains include decreased physical, cognitive, emotional, and sleep health.(3) Untreated or improperly managed SRC can increase the risk of additional concussions, resulting in enhanced potential for severe health consequences.(3)

Approximately 300,000 adolescents sustain a concussion annually while participating in organized athletics in the United States (U.S.) alone.(4) Countries other than the U.S. have not routinely collected epidemiological data, making it difficult to estimate the true incidence of concussions. Several studies reported girls experienced significantly higher concussion rates compared to boys.(4-6) However, other studies have demonstrated little to no sex-related differences when it comes to the rate of concussions.(7-9)

SRC is increasingly recognized as a public health issue (1, 10, 11), resulting in increased media attention, educational efforts, and research.(4, 12) Despite such increased coverage, many SRCs still go unreported because of lack of awareness among coaches, parents, match officials, sports trainers, and athletes themselves.(1)

Due to the severe consequences of SRC, governments and sport governing bodies around the world have enacted numerous measures including changes to legislation,(13, 14) changes to rules of the game, and increased emphasis on coach education.(1) The U.S. enacted a statutory regime, with all U.S. states passing laws regarding SRC. In Scotland, the national agency for sport (SportScotland), devised and disseminated guidance for properly managing concussions across all sports.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

Though U.S. laws and Scotland's guidance have seemingly led to some advances in SRC awareness and management, there is much room for improvement.(1, 13, 15) Generally, the implementation of the U.S. laws has led to key stakeholders (e.g., coaches, parents, athletes, sport administrators, game officials/referees) and the public widely accepting the concussion laws and creation of concussion protocols in high schools, which may be associated with increased reporting of concussions.(13) However, parents and athletes resist following concussion protocols when they perceive that compliance is at odds especially with athletic goals, or when necessary monetary or staffing resources are not available.(13) Many sport stakeholders are not yet adequately informed by the law and require more education.(13) As such, uniformity "on the books" of U.S. concussion laws obscures a tremendous amount of variation of the laws "in practice."(11)

Effective implementation of concussion laws requires multiple stakeholders using various existing resources.(16) Studies involving nationwide samples suggest that concussion laws are having an impact, but more research is needed to fully understand the true effects of their implementation.(13) Research should focus on theory-driven approaches to educational interventions and program development that encompass multifaceted approaches, including those concerned with policy, community, and sport stakeholders.(17) Additionally, researchers should evaluate policies currently in practice to determine which statutory provisions have the desired impact focusing not only on the letter of the law, but on how individual jurisdictions operationalize the law.(11, 13) This study used a theoretical lens to investigate girls' youth soccer coaches' role in implementing concussion laws and regulations.

Coaches play a very important role in recognizing, managing, and encouraging the reporting of concussions. As such, they have a professional and ethical duty to be knowledgeable about concussion safety, as well as to communicate such to their athletes.(1) A coach's concussion-related education and expertise, along with contextual considerations, such as the importance of the match or the role of the player involved, influence coaching decisions on SRC management.(1) However, a paucity of research examines knowledge translation of

1
2
3 SRC to safe practices in the athletic context under different regulatory schemes. The purpose of the present
4
5
6 study helps address this gap by examining factors affecting coaches' SRC management from a new theoretical
7
8 perspective.(1)

9
10 Legal consciousness is concerned with the contextual considerations in which organizations, social networks,
11
12 working relationships, and informal interactions influence the behavior of individuals. As such, legal
13
14 consciousness frameworks may inform coaches' understanding and responses to concussion and how these
15
16 might be consistent with, or different to, those that 'the law' envisages. On a theoretical level, this study
17
18 illustrates the implications of the social processes that collectively reconstruct meanings and identities(18)
19
20 while, on a practical level, explores how coaches' experiences and attitudes can shape their responses to an
21
22 athlete who has sustained an injury. Specifically, this study's fundamental question was: "what is the legal
23
24 consciousness of girls' youth soccer coaches regarding concussion management under a statutory legal regime
25
26 in the U.S. as compared to a non-statutory regime in Scotland?"
27
28

29 30 *United States concussion laws*

31
32 Washington state passed the first U.S. concussion law, known as the Lystedt law, in July 2009. It
33
34 contained three essential components: mandatory education of athletes and parents, removal from play at the
35
36 time of suspected head injury, and return to play only with written permission of a licensed, concussion-trained
37
38 healthcare provider after a minimum of 24 hours. By 2014, all 50 states and the District of Columbia had
39
40 similar legislation.(14, 15) However, while the vast majority of states statutes are based on the framework
41
42 derived from the Lystedt Law, no standardization exists among states.(14)
43
44

45
46 Statutes vary in youth sport program applicability, the definition of youth sport programs, type of sport
47
48 activities covered, designated party for removal of athletes, and medical clearance required for athletes to return
49
50 to play.(14) Most concussion laws address education and training requirements for key youth sport
51
52 stakeholders, (14) but only five states explicitly require evaluation of the efficacy of coach education or
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

1
2
3 information requirements.(19) Some concussion statutes provide legal protection for certain parties from civil
4
5 liability (i.e., ordinary negligence) arising from concussion-related injuries or death provided they acted in good
6
7 faith and according to the statutory requirements.(14) Statutes vary in their language, but generally do not create
8
9 new causes of legal action.(13)

10
11
12 Following this first wave of concussion legislation, states began to revisit the issue.(13) Since initial
13
14 passage, 22 states have amended their laws to: (1) expand coverage of the law (e.g., to include younger grades
15
16 or recreational sports leagues), (2) tighten or clarify existing requirements, or (3) improve efforts to prevent
17
18 concussions and improve early detection.”(10, 13) Even with these amendments, scholars have pointed out a
19
20 variety of flaws in the statutes and suggested the laws could improve the scope of coverage, reporting and
21
22 enforcement mechanisms, provide resources for implementation, place greater emphasis on prevention, and
23
24 evaluation, and better define concussion. (13, 20) Commentators also observe that these statutes often leave few
25
26 options for legal redress.(13, 20)

27
28
29 Critics of the U.S. concussion laws recognize uncertainty regarding the law’s implementation and
30
31 evaluation.(13, 16) Without litigation as a vehicle for accountability, and given the vast majority of statutes do
32
33 not mandate concussion reporting, anecdotal evidence that the laws are promoting more effective concussion
34
35 management policies is challenging to validate.(13) Despite such uncertainty, following the enactment of this
36
37 legislation, studies demonstrated an increase in key stakeholders’ awareness and knowledge regarding SRC, the
38
39 rate of reporting, and in concussion-related healthcare utilization among children.(3, 4, 12, 15)

40
41
42 Rivara et al. found the majority of high school athletes continued to practice or play while symptomatic,
43
44 and 40% reported that their coaches were not aware of their concussive symptoms. Coach awareness of
45
46 athletes’ concussions did not vary significantly by the different modalities for concussion education received by
47
48 coaches or the coach’s knowledge of the state’s concussion law.(19)

1
2
3
4 According to a recent systematic review, the level of knowledge regarding identification, initial management,
5
6 and return to play in SRC was moderate among the majority of coaches and match officials. However, essential
7
8 gaps in knowledge were still present.(1) Though concussion knowledge is consistently higher amongst those
9
10 who received education on SRC, dissemination of concussion education among coaches and officials appear to
11
12 be inadequate despite increasing efforts to increase awareness.(1) These results indicate that current education
13
14 efforts mandated by U.S. law may not be enough to help athletes and coaches safely manage SRC.(1, 15)

15 16 17 *Scotland's concussion guidance*

18
19 In an attempt to better guide officials, parents, teachers, and athletes to properly identify and manage
20
21 concussions, in 2015, medical professionals, the Scottish Government, and SportScotland collaborated to create
22
23 a single concussion regulation for all sports within the country.(21) In March 2018, Scotland released updates
24
25 on the guidelines, following an international conference on sport-related concussion in Berlin the previous
26
27 year.(21) The updated guidelines provide a consistent, accurate, and evidence-based approach regarding
28
29 concussion management for all Scottish sports.(21) The primary aim of the 2018 version was to deliver a
30
31 consistent message regarding proper recommendations on concussion safety.(21)

32
33
34
35 The Scottish Football (Soccer) Association (F.A.) tweeted out a link to the new guidelines; however, it
36
37 garnered only 29 “likes,” 22 retweets, and two comments, suggesting a lack of public engagement.(22)
38
39 SportScotland hosts the concussion guidance on its website to which the Scottish F.A. links.(21, 23) However,
40
41 Scottish Women's Soccer, which manages most women's soccer tournaments in Scotland, does not reference
42
43 the guidelines on their website nor in their documents and downloads.(24)

44
45
46
47 The United Kingdom's Football (Soccer) Association (F.A.) and the Professional Footballers'
48
49 Association (PFA) funded the FIELD study in 2019 that investigated the incidence of degenerative
50
51 neurocognitive disease in ex-professional soccer players.(25) Following the publication of the FIELD study, the
52
53 F.A. established an independently-chaired research task force to guide the governing body on possible changes
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

1
2
3
4 to heading guidance, concussion management protocols, and related research initiatives.(26) The taskforce
5
6 collaborated with UEFA's medical committee to update heading guidance for the F.A., the Irish F.A., and the
7
8 Scottish F.A. to mitigate potential risks from heading.(26) The updated heading guidance, introduced in
9
10 February 2020, provides grassroots clubs, coaches, and players with recommended heading guidance for
11
12 training sessions.(26) The guidance purports to help coaches and teachers reduce repetitive and unnecessary
13
14 heading in youth soccer.(26) The updated heading guidance includes: advice on training for all age groups
15
16 between under-six and under-18, no heading in practice for primary school children, a graduated approach to
17
18 heading-related training for children in the development phase between under-12 to under-16, and regulations
19
20 on ball sizes for training and matches for each age group.(26)
21
22

Theoretical framework

Legal consciousness

23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

Legal consciousness, a form of socio-legal scholarship, examines the role of law in every-day life and seeks to highlight the relationships and the contradictions between 'law in the books' (i.e., legislation, court decisions, governing body regulations) and 'law in action' (i.e., individuals' daily practices influenced by those sources).(27, 28) Theoretically, legal consciousness explains how law sustains its institutional power across vast periods, space, and variable performance.(29) Often defined as an "outcome of social processes through which meanings and identities are collectively reconstructed,"(18) legal consciousness draws on sociological and anthropological traditions, encompassing a person's attitudes toward, willingness to mobilize, suppositions about, and experiences of the law.(28) Legal consciousness' broad intellectual movement paralleled the "cultural turn" that swept across the humanities and social sciences. It posits that law, like religion or politics, can be seen as a cultural practice, a collective process of creating, stabilizing, organizing, and reproducing meanings that both enable and constrain the way people conduct themselves.(30, 31)

1
2
3
4 Legal consciousness traces how law is experienced and interpreted by specific individuals as they
5
6
7 engage, avoid, or resist the law and its meanings.(29) It is the “commonsense understanding” of how the law
8
9 works.(32) People make connections from their past experiences with the law and legal actors – good or bad –
10
11 which arise in part from the social positions they occupy – and these experiences shape their understanding of
12
13 the law.(32) Furthermore, legal consciousness refers to what people do as well as say about the law.(29) It is a
14
15 reciprocal process in which the meanings given by individuals to their world become patterned, stabilized, and
16
17 objectified, which is a type of social practice that reflect and form social structures.(29) People generally do not
18
19 contest legal authority because a good part of legality invisibly suffuses every-day life, rendering law a durable
20
21 and influential invention.(29) People are habituated to routinized forms of legal authority throughout ordinary
22
23 life, such as traffic lanes, parking rules, ticket stubs, and sales receipts.(29)

24
25
26 The three orientations to the law include conformity before the law, engagement with the law, and
27
28 resistance against the law. Conformity before the law connotes discussions of law as a sphere separate from
29
30 society, “objective, distinct, formally ordered and rational...compounded by a reification of law’s ability to
31
32 ‘know’ what the correct solution should be” which may reflect a sense of individual powerlessness.
33
34 Engagement with the law characterizes law as a game, where the skilled and resourceful can make strategic
35
36 gains and which is “invoked by the perception that law can be changed whether through judicial, societal or
37
38 political means.” Resistance against the law reflects a belief that the law is to be avoided rather than bowing to
39
40 its power or playing its game, perhaps exemplified by “pilfering, violence or the threat of violence, tricks,
41
42 institutional disruptions, foot-dragging, humor, storytelling, and gossip.” It implies resistance to law’s power,
43
44 terrain, and its scope, with tactics and strategies being central to the practices of resistance and revealed in what
45
46 people do as much as in what they say.(27)

47
48
49 The radically different approaches to SRC in Scotland and the United States provide an opportunity to
50
51 reflect on the place of ‘the law’ within legal consciousness. Instruments of governance or persuasion which are
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

not immediately rooted in legislation, like regulations or caselaw, are still an element of one's legal consciousness. The sources and their origins differ, but their influence is no less significant.

The statutory regime in the U.S. or voluntary adherence to guidelines in Scotland informed interviewees' understanding of how change in SRC management has been achieved or resisted, or how their own practices have been altered or entrenched. Silbey noted that legal consciousness should be a tool for examining the mutually constitutive relationship between the pragmatic policy recommendations of 'law in action' and the academic examination of the 'law in books.'⁽³⁰⁾ Empirical research is needed to appreciate the gap between official legal rules and the conduct of legal actors.⁽³¹⁾ Utilizing legal consciousness to compare the two countries' approaches to SRC management allows us to contribute to such exploration.

Method

Participants

The researchers assembled a convenience sample of ten soccer coaches in central Scotland and ten coaches in northeast Florida, U.S. We recruited coaches from girls' high school teams in Florida, all of which were paid positions. The U.S. sample included four female coaches. All but two of the U.S. coaches were parents and their average age was 49.6 years old.

The Scottish coaches led youth club teams of girl's ages 13-18 years old and were primarily white, male, and volunteer. We were not able to recruit high school coaches in Scotland since girls' high school soccer teams do not exist in Scotland. Only two of the Scottish coaches were female. Both of those coaches were paid, as well as one of the male coaches. The Scottish coaches averaged 37.8 years old and four of them were parents.

Data collection and procedures

We developed semi-structured interview questions after a comprehensive review of the literature. A panel of six experts including youth sport coaches, concussion safety specialists, and qualitative researchers

1
2
3 reviewed the items for comprehensiveness, clarity, and formatting. Researchers made minor modifications to
4
5
6 the questions after the expert panel review. The Institutional Review Board approved the present study before
7
8 the study commenced.
9

10 The primary researcher conducted the semi-structured interviews in central Scotland from May through
11
12 July 2018, and in Florida from January to October 2019. Participation in the interview was voluntary and
13
14 without incentives. The interviews lasted on average 45-90 minutes and were based on eleven questions
15
16 regarding concussion management. These questions asked coaches about (1) athlete safety and SRC in general,
17
18 and their (2) opinions on importance and prevalence of SRC in girls' youth soccer, (3) experiences with athletes
19
20 who may have had SRC, (4) management of SRC, and (5) thoughts on concussion laws/guidance. To ensure
21
22 accuracy, the interview transcripts were sent back to the Scottish coaches for their review.
23
24
25

26 Transcripts of all 20 interviews were distributed to the researchers. Two researchers then coded the
27
28 interview transcripts utilizing cycles of descriptive and structural coding. To ensure inter-coder reliability, each
29
30 researcher coded the transcripts separately, and the primary researcher resolved any divergence through
31
32 adjudication. Descriptive coding assigns basic labels to data to provide an inventory of topics.(33) Structural
33
34 coding applies a conceptual phrase representing a topic of inquiry to a segment of data that relates to specific
35
36 research questions used to frame the interview.(33)
37
38
39

40 Finally, the researchers used the legal consciousness theory of “three orientations to the law” as the
41
42 guiding topics of inquiry: conformity before the law, engagement with the law, and resistance against the
43
44 law.(27) Additionally, the researchers identified consistent subthemes in interviews by calculating code
45
46 frequency based on comments aligned with each orientation and subtheme. Researchers then paired guiding
47
48 orientations with direct quotations from the transcripts.
49
50

Results

The findings suggest coaches' legal consciousness included a version of conformity and engagement, but little resistance, and observed variance between U.S. and Scottish coaches. However, their thoughts did not fit precisely into the three traditional legal consciousness orientations in which the categories were not mutually exclusive. We also identified subthemes regarding (1) willingness to participate in SRC training, (2) uncertainty – around the regulations, recognizing SRC, and how to respond to SRC, (3) a desire for/reliance on assistance in management of SRC from other stakeholders – including match officials, parents, and medical professionals, and (4) gender differences.

On average, female coaches indicated higher levels of consciousness regarding SRC management guidelines than male coaches. The paid coaches also had more knowledge and awareness than volunteer coaches. All of the U.S. coaches (all coached in high school) were paid, while the majority of the Scottish coaches were volunteers. Coaches who had played soccer themselves generally had more consciousness regarding SRC management guidelines. All but one of U.S. coaches had personally sustained a concussion, while only one of the Scottish coaches had a prior concussion. One Scottish coach noted, "Once you have experienced it personally, having experienced it...it's definitely changed the way I deal with it, just putting player safety the number one thing." In addition, a U.S. coach stated, "actually both of my daughters had concussions...So, I'm a little more sensitive to that." Another U.S. coach emphasized, "I think if you've had a concussion...it makes a difference. You realize it's not something to play around with."

Scottish and Florida coaches who had the most recent first aid training (some of which are required) indicated more consciousness regarding SRC management guidelines. Likewise, coaches with more administrative responsibilities for their organization had more knowledge regarding SRC management guidelines presumably due to more frequent communication with their governing bodies. Likewise, coaches in organizations with more resources had higher levels of consciousness. Organizations with more resources were

able to provide additional related-training as well as increased access to physios/athletic trainers. Additionally, those organizations observed closer relationships with specialized medical professionals.

The most potent examples of Scottish coaches' resistance was from coaches who had previously coached in the U.S. These coaches objected to the best practices of SRC management in the U.S., not their own country's guidelines. In response to the U.S. club soccer rule that limits a practice session to only 5 minutes of heading training, a Scottish coach said, "It's almost as if they don't want any responsibility and [to be able to say] 'that is not my fault'." "I think it is taken too seriously over there, and [they should] chill a little bit." Several Scottish coaches noted the more litigious culture in the U.S. "I guess over in America they are crazy about suing each other and lawsuits for breaking a toenail and just everything." A U.S. coach supported that, saying, "Guess everybody's terrified by litigation." When asked about Scotland enacting SRC laws similar to the U.S., a coach replied, "People would think 'what is going on?' That is ridiculous." Another noted, "the Britain view in particular is very anti-law...it would be certainly negative...it would probably be a sledgehammer."

Table 1. Interview code frequency.

Orientation/subtheme	Scotland coaches (<i>n</i> = 182) <i>n</i> (%)	Florida (U.S.) coaches (<i>n</i> = 185) <i>n</i> (%)
Conform	32 (17.6%)	51 (27.6%)
Engage	25 (13.7%)	17 (9.2%)
Resist	16 (8.8%)	8 (4.3%)
Uncertainty		
Guidelines	6 (3.3%)	0 (0%)
Recognizing SRC	17 (9.3%)	12 (6.5%)
Addressing SRC	9 (4.9%)	4 (2.2%)
Training		
Online	7 (3.8%)	21 (11.4%)
In-person	9 (4.9%)	7 (3.8%)
Assistance		
Parents	12 (6.6%)	8 (4.3%)
Match officials	6 (3.3%)	7 (3.8%)
Medical professionals	23 (12.6%)	40 (21.6%)
Gender difference	20 (11%)	10 (5.4%)

366

367

368

369

370

371 Table 2. Interview quotes.

Orientation/ subtheme	Scotland coaches	Florida (U.S.) coaches
Conform	<p>“A law or guidelines, for me it doesn’t make a big difference because essentially we follow both of them. I would be happy either way, as long as it’s something clear for everyone.”</p> <p>“At the end of the day, if it is mandatory, you will do it.”</p> <p>“The health care provider. So, whatever they said...whatever they suggested...that would be the deciding factor.”</p> <p>“Before I would say play on, but now we oversee the kids...I must take responsibility of them.”</p> <p>“A girl...banged her head and... didn’t feel well...she was taken off...and didn’t go back on. So we did deal with that correctly.”</p> <p>“If you have been removed, they are conscious of the time to play protocols.”</p> <p>“I think an online course would be fine.”</p> <p>“what [would] cement the guidance...is to see some practical examples.”</p> <p>“Remove them from the game, no question about that.”</p> <p>“Sit out is the basic move from the government push.”</p>	<p>“There’s a standard protocol they follow.”</p> <p>“More general, when in doubt, sit them out. That’s kind of like the motto.”</p> <p>“It’s good...it does emphasize the very seriousness of it.”</p> <p>“Obviously here...with litigation...everybody’s going to err on the side of caution.”</p> <p>“Even though it sometimes...seems excessive and repetitive...I think it’s still a good thing that we have to do every year, be aware of what’s happening and watching out for these injuries...It’s definitely been a positive.”</p> <p>“It’s better safe than sorry. Especially, just liability wise, not only caring about the child. You can get in a lot of trouble if something is wrong and you don’t pull the child.”</p> <p>“If I was in any way uncertain...you sit out...you would never send somebody back into play who has the potential of a concussion.”</p> <p>“Everybody knows the expression ‘when in doubt, sit them out.’ So...I’ve never taken any chances with that.”</p> <p>“I’m more than happy to sacrifice a victory and pull a player that needs to be pulled. A few years ago I probably be ‘oh, they look fine’. But now I’m more likely to...make that substitution.”</p>
Engage	<p>“If you attach a brand to it, people will go...the Rangers put their name on it and...suddenly they are getting 200 Rangers fans coming.”</p> <p>“Simplifying the information...increasing confidence in it”</p> <p>“Maybe referees have more training.”</p> <p>“It’s a topic that needs its own part of the [Scottish Women’s Soccer] website.”</p> <p>“The biggest problem...is that the majority of research...is around males.”</p>	<p>“I’m looking forward to changes in the game...also advancements in the head protection gear.”</p> <p>“Those players that have experienced a head injury speaking to other players or...coaches.”</p> <p>“They could require everybody to wear some kind of helmet.”</p> <p>“If there’s info on how to prevent concussions then I would love to know.”</p> <p>“Parent education could be massively improved.”</p>

1
2
3 “There are no resources in Scotland to be able to properly track it [SRC
4 incidence]...there is no login system, so how would you know how
5 prevalent it is?” “I wish they would expand it [SRC online training] and make it a little more
6 “Soccer should look to other sports.” challenging.”
7 “I think parent education workshops would be really important.”
8 “Educate the players themselves.”

8 372

9 373

11 374

14 375 Table 2. Interview quotes. (continued)

Orientation/ subtheme	Scotland coaches	Florida (U.S.) coaches
Resist	<p>18 “On April Fool’s Day it comes out...in Scotland...heading is 19 banned...and we’re like “it is April Fools Day.” 20 “I don’t think some coaches would do [extra SRC training], [when in 21 the U.S.] I opened up all the pages at the same time because that was the 22 easiest way...I think it is one step too far for people here.” 23 “They don’t have any way to enforce that [return to play protocol]. It is 24 guidelines. It is not the law.” 25 “I think there is not enough evidence to be able to be a deterrent.” 26 “The guidance us the very safest side now since we have had so many 27 years of essentially no guidance...now the pendulum is swinging all the 28 way the other directions”</p>	<p>18 “I’ve probably done the Florida concussion course 10 times, where I’m like, 19 ‘Ugh, it’s redundant.” 20 “There is always a degree of resentment to any form of training I find...Is it 21 welcomed? Probably no.” 22 “You get desensitized to it...I watch a bunch of videos...and...there’s always 23 the denial that ‘it’s not going to be my kid.”” 24 “One of the reasons I quit high school coaching was because of more and more 25 requirements.” 26 “The downside is that we’re not allowed to do heading practice...a lot of 27 coaches are frustrated because they can’t teach them how to head.”</p>
Uncertainty	<p>31 “In terms of specific instructions and the enforcing of that...there is no 32 clear law.” 33 “You really don’t know what to do with the player.” 34 “If you don’t know what the longer-term impact of heading a ball is, 35 then it is difficult to change.” 36 “I think it is just a grey area.” 37 “Research is advancing into concussion and so that information are out 38 of date.” 39 “Concussion is a hard topic because kids can sometimes look okay even 40 if you checked them.” 41 “Should you take the player off then? I don’t know.” 42 “Why is it six weeks and not 4? What is the difference... 43 physiologically?” 44 “You’re fine or you’re not because the guidance says you are not?”</p>	<p>31 “Even with all that [SRC symptoms] the CT scan was negative...it’s...quite 32 astonishing.” 33 “It’s just a lack of understanding. It’s too complex.” 34 “Medicine’s certainly not an exact science, so I would never be confident in 35 being able to diagnose a concussion or clearing somebody of a concussion.” 36 “It’s so subjective, that we don’t have a test...that’s a challenge, ‘cause how do 37 you know?”</p>

1
2 376
3 377
4 378
5 379
6 380
7 381
8
9 382
10
11 383
12
13
14 Table 2. Interview quotes. (continued)
15

Orientation/ subtheme	Scotland coaches	Florida (U.S.) coaches
Training	<p>“I would not have a problem at all. If it is medical related ad efforts to encourage the safety of your players I would have no issue about that.”</p> <p>“They’ll go but if there is an incentive, free coaching courses and free entrance to tournaments, if there is a chance for a coach to get a free badge then they are going to go and listen to that information.”</p> <p>“It is hard to see how it [online training] would piss anyone off because it is not much.”</p> <p>“I think an online course would be fine.”</p>	<p>“I think the training’s good...because it does emphasize the seriousness of it.”</p> <p>“I do worry a little bit about that [online SRC training] becoming more of like a ‘yeah, yeah, yeah, check, check, check,’ whereas face to face may be a little more effective.”</p> <p>“Like any training, in particularly having done it one year...it’s a refresher, so it’s not that arduous.”</p> <p>“You have to go through that training, and the training was informative...I think they take it seriously.”</p> <p>“Even though you get a little desensitized to them because I see them so often, there’s still new information in them...I think it’s good.”</p> <p>“It’s a little repetitive, but I think they’re stressing an important...trying to make it raise your awareness, elevate your knowledge.”</p> <p>“It’s very repetitive. It’s the same course every year. So I wish they would expand it and make it a little more challenging, a little more informative.”</p>
Assistance	<p>“There is help from the physios and the doctors regarding the health of the players and while coaches are not given too much information on what to do in certain situations but obviously trusted qualified people [deal with] that.”</p> <p>“I think...a physio or first aid trained person has to be the one to deal with a head injury...the referee has to have the responsibility to say you can’t come back on the pitch.”</p> <p>“The referee is the neutral one on the pitch, then they can say that a player needs to come off the pitch and if they make the decision then you need to train the referees.”</p> <p>“You would absolutely hope that the referee is fully up to speed.”</p> <p>“We’re relying on the parents.”</p>	<p>“I just turned everything over to the trainer.”</p> <p>“It got taken out of your hands and that’s really the best.”</p> <p>“I send her off to the athletic trainer, because of course he’s more qualified than I am.”</p> <p>“I would always defer to the trainer.”</p> <p>“The trainer is the first line of defense.”</p> <p>“No one’s going out on the field until I’ve heard it from three or four people that they’re allowed out.”</p> <p>“The high schools all have athletic trainers at the fields. So if there’s any doubt, it’s no longer my decision. I call a trainer, ‘Hey, can you evaluate my player for me?’”</p>

1
2
3 “Send them to the hospital, to a professional...If you’re not sure, send to the hospital.”
4 “The hospital, the health care provider...whatever they said...whatever they suggested...that would be the defining factor.”
5 “We don’t have the resource or finance to be able to put medical professionals on-site at the youth games.”
6 “Now at the senior end of the game, I’m fortunate I can rely on a doctor.”
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47

“I think the referee is required to remove a player from the game if he thinks there was a head to head or some kind of head contact.”
“We have administrators, trainers, athletic director, even the principal at almost every home match...we’ve always got plenty of help.”
“And since our school is part of [university]...”Go see out concussion specialist at [university].”
“If someone did not have an athletic trainer on-site, that would be a different ballgame.”
“I call the parents and I check on them and I ask them to please review this fact sheet of symptoms.”
“It was taken out of the school’s hands, it became a medical decision.”

384
385 Table 2. Interview quotes. (continued)

Orientation/ subtheme	Scotland coaches	Florida (U.S.) coaches
Gender difference	<p>“In women’s soccer...[is] not quite there yet with same professional standards of medical care as guys.” “[in] The Scottish game, if you are injured you go on with it...unfortunately, it transpired to the woman’s game because a lot of the coaches are males coming from male backgrounds so if you get injured, ‘deal with it, walk it off.’” “There is not really many kind of challenges...it is not the boys’ soccer where you get your elbow up and struck them jumping.” “Women’s soccer is slower pace than guy’s soccer...it’s not played in the air as much.” “Boys are more physical...my girls are very gentle...there is no one really that goes out of the way to be aggressive.” “My intuition is it [SRC] is a bigger issue in boys sport because they tend to be more aggressive.” “Girls are less prepared to go in and hot the ball and so I think we will see a lot more head contact in boys youth soccer.”</p>	<p>“On the boys' side, when they go up for a header, when they clash heads, they’ve gotten a concussion right there...but with the girls...it’s been headers and sometimes a bad fall when they hit their head on the ground.” “I think...in some ways concussions might be a little more prevalent on the girls' side than the boys' side. One of the biggest things I read about is, the girls’ neck muscles aren’t nearly as strong, so there’s more whip.” “There’s way more girls [who] wear the headband...than the boys.”</p>

387 **Discussion**

388 The coaches' responses regarding legal consciousness supports the idea that people make
389 connections from their past experiences – good or bad – which arise in part from the social
390 positions they occupy – and these experiences shape their understanding of the law.(32) The
391 coaches' knowledge and attitudes towards SRC management and regulations varied according to
392 their gender, volunteer status, playing experience, recentness of first aid training, administrative
393 role within their school or club, and strength and size of resources of their school or club. This
394 finding is consistent with Young and Billing's legal consciousness research which reinforces that
395 acquiescence or deference to legal system authority may reflect broader cultural differences
396 between people from different backgrounds.(34)

397 Many of these factors intersect, making it difficult to parse which experiences or social
398 positions have greater influence on the coaches' legal consciousness. For example, among the
399 U.S. participants, we were not able to identify which personal/demographic factors had the most
400 influence on the coach's legal consciousness given the complexities of intersections between
401 gender, personal experience with concussion, and occupational status (paid/volunteer).
402 Similarly, Young and Billings noted the complex interaction between race, gender, and cultural
403 capital in producing legal consciousness.(34)

404 Overall, the coaches' legal consciousness does support the idea that legal authority is
405 typically not contested due to its ubiquitousness in every-day life.(29) Concussion management
406 regulation and training, especially by the Florida coaches, were seen as something to follow
407 without much critical thought. For instance, the Florida coaches exhibited conformity more often
408 than the Scottish coaches, and expressions of conformity were a more substantial proportion of
409 their comments than the Scottish coaches.

1
2
3 410 Respondents did “conform,” by following the guidelines they were aware of, and within
4
5 411 their abilities. All of the U.S. coaches were aware of the concussion law, while only a few
6
7 412 Scottish coaches knew about the guidelines. However, the coaches did not indicate that they felt
8
9 413 powerless, often a characteristic of conformity to law.(27) The Scottish coaches did view the
10
11 414 guidelines as separate from their day to day life since they did not think the prevalence of SRC in
12
13 415 girls’ soccer was high, as evidenced by their reported personal experiences with concussions.
14
15 416 The Florida coaches believed that SRC often occurs in girls’ high school soccer and appeared
16
17 417 more resigned to conformity through mandated concussion training.
18
19
20
21

22 418 Our findings also suggest that the coaches in general were somewhat engaged with the
23
24 419 law. Neither group of coaches perceived concussion guidance or laws as a “game to play.” They
25
26 420 did view the guidelines as changeable, as respondents from both Scotland and Florida indicated
27
28 421 their own management of SRC had changed over time. Scottish coaches desired more
29
30 422 information as the science regarding concussion improves, while Florida coaches preferred new
31
32 423 and more engaging training modules. This finding suggests that a person’s engagement with the
33
34 424 law in a particular situation depends on a complex and dynamic set of processes. For instance,
35
36 425 one’s experiences, attitudes, understanding of one’s identity, and one’s beliefs about social
37
38 426 norms can be factors that determine a level of engagement with the law.(28)
39
40
41

42 427 Meanwhile, active resistance to the law was largely absent from the respondents as there
43
44 428 were no examples of them purposefully trying to avoid the regulations. Nevertheless, some
45
46 429 Scottish coaches expressed skepticism that the guidelines do not accurately reflect best practices
47
48 430 regarding the handling of medical complications and return-to-play protocols. Such findings
49
50 431 suggest the need for attitude changes toward the guidelines which may be accomplished through
51
52 432 nationwide educational campaigns regarding concussion safety led by government and sport
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

1
2
3 433 governing bodies. Concussion-related educational interventions also should be developed from a
4
5 434 theoretical basis to help create more positive attitudes toward the guidelines.
6

7
8 435 The U.S. coaches, on the other hand, resisted the repetitiveness of the mandated SRC
9
10 436 training. Kroshus, et al. also noted that educational materials providing information that was not
11
12 437 new to respondents may decrease its efficacy in changing SRC management behavior.(35) This
13
14 438 suggests the need for more frequent updates to the educational modules, consistent with the ever-
15
16 439 changing science surrounding prevention and management of concussion. These findings
17
18 440 support previous calls on avoiding “one size fits all” mandates for concussion education.(17, 35)
19
20

21 441 Both sets of coaches chafed at the idea of banning heading as a means of reducing
22
23 442 concussions. A U.S. coach stated, “You’ll change the game. I would hate to see that.” Another
24
25 443 exclaimed, “For concussion reasons, I’m sure it’s better. For soccer reasons it’s horrible.” A
26
27 444 Scottish coach said, “I think it would be ridiculed over here.” To date, banning and/or restricting
28
29 445 heading has led to critical debate within the soccer community. While limiting heading may be
30
31 446 associated with reducing the mechanisms responsible for concussions,(36) others may argue that
32
33 447 limiting heading may be counterproductive in the long-term due to the potential reduction in
34
35 448 proper heading-related instruction and practice. Moving forward, policy makers should continue
36
37 449 follow evidence-based research regarding the true effects of heading on concussions.
38
39
40

41
42 450 The U.S. coaches expressed less uncertainty regarding the guidelines they were expected
43
44 451 to follow. All of the U.S. coaches were aware of the SRC law and its’ implementation as
45
46 452 required by the Florida High School Athletic Association. The U.S. coaches also indicated less
47
48 453 uncertainty than the Scottish coaches regarding recognition of SRC and proper management
49
50 454 actions. This is consistent with Yeo et al.’s recent review that found most coaches and officials
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

1
2
3 455 could identify common signs and symptoms of SRC, understood the importance of immediate
4
5 456 removal from play, and allowed return to play only under the guidance of medical advice.(1)

7
8 457 This is likely due to the mandatory concussion training highlighted by the law as a
9
10 458 prerequisite to coach in a Florida high school. This mandatory training, which is typically
11
12 459 conducted online, may explain why the U.S. coaches mentioned a willingness to engage in
13
14 460 online training more often than the Scottish coaches. It is possible that the latter may not have
15
16 461 been exposed to online SRC training previously.

18
19 462 Though both sets of coaches voiced a desire to include other stakeholders in making
20
21 463 return to play decisions, the U.S. coaches mentioned the benefits of deferring to medical
22
23 464 professionals more often. This may be the result of a more frequent presence of athletic trainers
24
25 465 and/or other medical professionals in the U.S. high school settings compared to those of
26
27 466 Scotland. Because concussion is difficult to identify and diagnose, it is understandable that
28
29 467 coaches need to work with medically trained personnel on-site for assistance with SRC
30
31 468 management. In contrast, very few of the Scottish clubs had the resources to provide a first-
32
33 469 aider/athletic trainer or physio at girls' soccer games. This finding provides support for increased
34
35 470 funding and resources to employ more medical professionals at Scottish youth soccer events. The
36
37 471 results of this study suggest that girls' soccer coaches are willing to follow and engage with
38
39 472 concussion management regulations in both the U.S. and Scotland. Coaches demonstrated a
40
41 473 desire to protect their players and for additional knowledge regarding SRC management.
42
43 474 Although law and governing body regulations serve as tools to improve concussion management,
44
45 475 youth sport stakeholders can benefit from educational programs that effectively educate and
46
47 476 increase SRC reporting in youth soccer.(12) Future legislative amendments should focus on a
48
49 477 more consistent enforcement of such educational programs and related policy mandates.(19)
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

1
2
3 478 Scottish youth soccer clubs, in particular, can play a key role in improving concussion
4
5 479 management. The use of health promotion and social marketing tools would improve the
6
7
8 480 dissemination and implementation of concussion guidelines.(19, 37) Increased dissemination of
9
10 481 guidelines may be particularly crucial in Scotland, where many of the coaches lacked knowledge
11
12 482 of the SportScotland guideline even before the recent policy changes regarding heading
13
14
15 483 restrictions. Clubs are already required to have a child protection officer, to whom they could
16
17 484 add the additional responsibility of concussion management. Scottish coaches also indicated the
18
19 485 desire and willingness to attend additional first aid training specific to concussion management.
20
21 486 Soccer clubs should consider offering concussion safety workshops/trainings for all volunteer
22
23
24 487 coaches, as well as parents, match officials, and athletes.

25
26 488 The U.S. coaches provided support for updated and revised training on concussion
27
28 489 management, using more real-time examples. Specifically, coaches in both countries preferred
29
30 490 additional in-person training opportunities, rather than online. Given the majority of coaches and
31
32
33 491 officials were eager to seek further education on SRC, sport governing bodies should improve
34
35 492 the accessibility of such educational programs and information sources.(1) In instances where in-
36
37
38 493 person training may not be feasible, online trainings should be designed to be user-friendly and
39
40 494 updated regularly.(1, 35) In addition, these trainings should be developed from a theoretical
41
42 495 basis, which can help guide coaches to reflect on their own experiences in recognizing and
43
44
45 496 managing concussion by bridging the gap between theoretical knowledge and practice.(1, 19)

46
47 497 Sport-specific rules have also been implemented as a means of SRC prevention.(38)
48
49 498 Governing bodies of youth soccer in the U.S. and Scotland should also consider rule changes to
50
51 499 improve concussion management. For instance, allowing rolling substitutions, which permits
52
53
54 500 players to enter and leave the game without restrictions, would allow for players to be assessed

1
2
3 501 more frequently whenever a concussion is suspected without impacting youth soccer
4
5 502 achievement. Officials can also play a role in the prevention of SRC by controlling physical
6
7 503 contact that may cause SRC (e.g., preventing high elbows in heading duels).(1)

9
10 504 Those responsible for creating policies derived from concussion laws and guidelines must
11
12 505 develop effective strategies in an effort to improve their implementation. These may include
13
14 506 defining roles of key individuals, promoting education, creating awareness, and facilitating
15
16 507 effective communication.(16) Further efforts should stress disseminating these common
17
18 508 implementation strategies and practices to a broader range of clubs and schools in both the U.S.
19
20 509 and Scotland.(16) Legislation without effective implementation strategies may not be the
21
22 510 answer, particularly in Scotland. Additionally, stakeholders should engage in more creative
23
24 511 research. They should collaboratively design feasible policies that are scientifically sound,
25
26 512 sensitive to the fidelity of implementation, aligned with the incentives of youth sport, and
27
28 513 promote inclusive data collection.(13)

32
33 514
34 515 ***Limitations***

36 516 The current study was limited by a small-sized convenience sample from only two
37
38 517 regions, which does not allow for the generalizability of the results. Second, response bias may
39
40 518 have resulted due to the interviewer's personal and demographic background (e.g., gender,
41
42 519 race/ethnicity, previous soccer playing and coaching experience). Another limitation is that, due
43
44 520 to the changes in the concussion legislation/guidelines since the interviews were conducted,
45
46 521 participants' legal consciousness may not have captured any potential updates to the
47
48 522 legislation/guidelines. Also, U.S. coaches may have been unwilling to admit resistance to the law
49
50 523 given the potential sanctions (e.g., suspension from coaching). Because of the statutory mandates
51
52 524 in the U.S., it is conceivable that respondents were hesitant to reveal noncompliance with the law
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

1
2
3 525 and provided socially acceptable answers. Despite these limitations, our findings are one of the
4
5 526 first to compare the legal consciousness of concussion safety regulations/guidelines among
6
7
8 527 international coaches. This study could be expanded to include interviews of Florida coaches of
9
10 528 girls' soccer clubs.

12 529 13 530 **Conclusions**

15
16 531 This study investigated the critical public health issue of SRC using a new theoretical
17
18 532 lens by comparing the legal consciousness of girls' youth soccer coaches regarding concussion
19
20 533 management under a statutory legal regime in the U.S. and a non-statutory scheme in Scotland.
21
22 534 The findings suggest coaches in both countries conform to and engage with concussion
23
24 535 laws/guidelines. However, the study found little resistance in either country to concussion
25
26
27 536 laws/guidelines. With the high incidence of concussions in girls' soccer, understanding coaches'
28
29 537 legal consciousness of concussion regulation is an important avenue to reduce this serious injury.

31 538

32 539

33 540

34 541

35 542

36 543

37 544

38 545

39 546

40 547

41 548

42 549

43 550

551 References

- 552 1. Yeo P, Probert J, Sim S, et al. A systematic review and qualitative analysis of concussion
553 knowledge amongst sports coaches and match officials. *J Sports Sci Med.* 2020; 19(1): 65-77.
- 554
555 2. McCrory P, Meeuwisse W, Dvorak J, et al. Consensus statement on concussion in sport-
556 the 5(th) international conference on concussion in sport held in Berlin, October 2016. *Br J*
557 *Sports Med.* 2017; 51(11): 838-47.
- 558
559 3. Jingzhen Y, Comstock RD, Honggang Y, et al. New and recurrent concussions in high-
560 school athletes before and after traumatic brain injury laws, 2005–2016. *American Journal of*
561 *Public Health.* 2017; 107(12): 1916-22.
- 562
563 4. Schallmo MS, Weiner JA, and Hsu WK. Sport and sex-specific reporting trends in the
564 epidemiology of concussions sustained by high school athletes. *JBJS.* 2017; 99(15): 1314-20.
- 565
566 5. Lincoln A, Caswell S, Almquist J, et al. Trends in concussion incidence in high school
567 sports: A prospective 11-year study. *Am J Sports Med.* 2011; 39: 958-63.
- 568
569 6. Harmon KG, Drezner JA, Gammons M, et al. American Medical Society for Sports
570 Medicine position statement: concussion in sport. *Br J Sports Med.* 2013; 47(1): 15-26.
- 571
572 7. Hall EE, and Ketcham CJ. *Concussions in athletics :Assessment, management and*
573 *emerging issues.* New York: Nova Science Publishers, Inc, 2017.
- 574
575 8. Boden BP, Kirkendall DT, and Garrett WE. Concussion incidence in elite college soccer
576 players. *Am J Sports Med.* 1998; 26(2): 238-41.
- 577
578 9. Schulz MR, Marshall SW, Mueller FO, et al. Incidence and risk factors for concussion in
579 high school athletes, North Carolina, 1996-1999. *Am J Epidemiol.* 2004; 160(10): 937-44.
- 580
581 10. Lowrey KM, Morain SR, and Baugh CM. Do ethics demand evaluation of public health
582 laws? Shifting scientific sands and the case of youth sports related traumatic brain injury laws. *J*
583 *Health Care Law Policy.* 2017; 19(1): 99-117.
- 584
585 11. Lowrey KM, and Morain SR. State experiences implementing youth sports concussion
586 laws: Challenges, successes, and lessons for evaluating impact. *Law Medicine Health Care.*
587 2014; 42(3): 290-6.
- 588
589 12. Covassin T, Petit KM, and Anderson M. Concussion in youth sport: Developmental
590 aspects. *Kinesiol Rev.* 2019; 8(3): 220-8.
- 591
592 13. Shen FX. Are youth sports concussion statutes working? *Duquesne Law Rev.* 2018;
593 56(1): 7-33.

- 1
2
3 595 14. Kim, SK, Connaughton DP, Spengler J, et al. Legislative efforts to reduce concussions in
4 596 youth sports: An analysis of state concussion statutes. *Journal of Legal Aspects of Sport*. 2017;
5 597 27(2): 162-86.
6 598
- 7 599 15. Zynda AJ, Sabatino MJ, Ellis HB, et al. Continued play following sport-related
8 600 concussion in United States Youth Soccer. *Int J Exerc Sci*. 2020; 13(6): 87-100.
9 601
- 10 602 16. Davies S, Coxe K, Harvey HH, et al. Qualitative evaluation of high school
11 603 implementation strategies for youth sports concussion laws. *J Athl Train* . 2018; 53(9): 873-9.
12 604
- 13 605 17. Register-Mihalik JK, Williams RM, Marshall SW, et al. Demographic, parental, and
14 606 personal factors and youth athletes' concussion-related knowledge and beliefs. *J Athl Train*.
15 607 2018; 53(8): 768-75.
16 608
- 17 609 18. Somers MR and Roberts CNJ. Toward a new sociology of rights: A genealogy of “buried
18 610 bodies” of citizenship and human rights. *Annu Rev Law Soc Sci*. 2008; 4: 40.
19 611
- 20 612 19. Rivara FP, Schiff MA, Chrisman SP, et al. The effect of coach education on reporting of
21 613 concussions among high school athletes after passage of a concussion law. *Am J Sports Med*.
22 614 2014; 42(5): 1197-203.
23 615
- 24 616 20. Harvey HH. Refereeing the public health. *Yale J Health Policy Law Ethics*. 2014; 14(1):
25 617 66-121.
26 618
- 27 619 21. Concussion management guidelines updated [press release]. Scottish Football
28 620 Association, March 7 2018.
29 621
- 30 622 22. @ScottishFA. NEWS | If in doubt, sit them out: Updated guidelines for concussion have
31 623 been released. Read more: <http://scotfaco/concussion>. [Twitter]. 2018 Mar 7 [cited 2020 June
32 624 17]. Available from: <https://twitter.com/ScottishFA/status/971400282549706752>
33 625
- 34 626 23. Scottish Sports Concussion Guidance: SportScotland; 2019 [updated October 29].
35 627 Available from: <https://sportscotland.org.uk/clubs/scottish-sports-concussion-guidance/>.
36 628
- 37 629 24. Scottish Women's Football. Documents and Downloads [Internet] [cited 2020 June 17].
38 630 Available from: <https://scotwomensfootball.com/documents-and-downloads/>.
39 631
- 40 632 25. The Football Association Our response to the effects of football on ex-professional
41 633 players [press release]: (2019 October 24) [cited 2020 June 17]. Available from:
42 634 <http://www.thefa.com/news/2019/oct/21/field-research-study-findings-211019>.
43 635
- 44 636 26. The Football Association. Updated heading guidance announced for youth training
45 637 sessions [press release] (2020 February 24) [cited 2020 June 17]. Available from:
46 638 <http://www.thefa.com/news/2020/feb/24/updated-heading-guidance-announcement-240220>.
47 639

- 1
2
3 640 27. Ewick P and Silbey S. Narrating social structure: Stories of resistance to legal authority.
4 641 *AJS*. 2003; 108(6): 1328.
5 642
6 643 28. Young KM. Everyone knows the game: Legal consciousness in the Hawaiian cockfight.
7 644 *Law Society Rev*. 2014; 48(3): 31.
8 645
9 646 29. Cane J editor. *The New Oxford Companion to Law*. Oxford, UK: Oxford University
10 647 Press; 2008. Legal consciousness. p. 1200.
11 648
12 649 30. Silbey S. After legal consciousness. *Annu Rev Law Soc Sci*. 2005; 1: 45.
13 650
14 651 31. Cornut St-Pierre P. Investigating legal consciousness through the technical work of elite
15 652 lawyers: A case study on tax avoidance. *Law Soc Rev*. 2019; 53(2): 323-52.
16 653
17 654 32. Nielsen LB. Situating legal consciousness: Experiences and attitudes of ordinary citizens
18 655 about law and street harassment. *Law Soc Rev*. 2000; 34(4): 1055.
19 656
20 657 33. Saldana J. *The coding manual for qualitative researchers*. Los Angeles: SAGE
21 658 Publications; 2015.
22 659
23 660 34. Young KM and Billings KR. Legal consciousness and cultural capital. *Law Soc Rev*.
24 661 2020; 54(1): 33-65.
25 662
26 663 35. Kroshus E, Baugh CM, Hawrilenko M, et al. Pilot randomized evaluation of publically
27 664 available concussion education materials: evidence of a possible negative effect. *Health Educ*
28 665 *Behav*. 2015; 42(2): 153-62.
29 666
30 667 36. Watson A and Mjaanes JM. Soccer injuries in children and adolescents. *Pediatrics*. 2019;
31 668 144(5): e20192759.
32 669
33 670 37. Finch CF, McCrory P, Ewing MT et al. Concussion guidelines need to move from only
34 671 expert content to also include implementation and dissemination strategies. *Br J Sports Med*.
35 672 2013; 47(1): 12-4.
36 673
37 674 38. Register-Mihalik J, Baugh C, Kroshus E, et al. Multifactorial approach to sport-related
38 675 concussion prevention and education: Application of the socioecological framework. *J Athl*
39 676 *Train*. 2017; 52(3): 195-205.
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60